

**Regional Energy Resource Council
Regional Resource Stewardship Council
Joint Meeting
November 3, 2022
Nashville, Tennessee
8:30 a.m. Central Time**

The Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA) Regional Energy Resource Council (RERC) and Regional Resource Stewardship Council (RRSC) convened a joint meeting on Thursday, November 3, 2022, in Nashville, Tennessee. Meeting presentations and a recording of the meeting are available at www.tva.gov/merc and www.tva.gov/rrsc.

RERC Council members attending in person:

Erin Gill (Chair), Rodney Goodman, Chrissy Heard, Candy Johnson, Jonathan Levenshus, Peter Mattheis, Dan Miller, Doug Peters, Bailey Recktenwald, Patrice Robinson, Alexa Voytek, Clay Walker and Lloyd Webb.

RERC Council members attending virtually:

Michael Butler, Dana Jeanes and Steve Livingston.

RRSC Council members attending in person:

Alan Gates, Richard Holland, Cline Jones, Kim Klinker, Ronald Lambert, John McConnell, Will Nelson, Ron Robertson, Danette Scudder, Bob Sneed, Stacey White and Greg Young.

RRSC Council members attending virtually:

Randy Wiggins

Designated Federal Officer for Joint Session: Melanie Farrell

Facilitator: Jo Anne Lavender

- Appendix A – TVA staff and stakeholders who attended the meeting
- Appendix B – Agenda

Purpose

The purpose of the meeting was to present information on TVA's sustainability program, biodiversity initiatives, and its environmental justice and Home Uplift programs, as well as to obtain RERC and RRSC Advice Statements on three advice questions related to TVA's environmental justice program. *(See Section 5 for questions.)*

1. Welcome and Introductions

- A.** Melanie Farrell welcomed everyone to the meeting and noted it was the first time the Councils met together in person. They held a joint meeting via Webex in 2021, but were unable to meet in person at that time due to Covid-19 safety protocols. She thanked everyone for making the time to participate.
- B.** Erin Gill, RERC Chair, welcomed everyone and noted there would be benefits of the Councils coming together to discuss the important topic of environmental justice. Danette Scudder filled in for RRSC Chair Tom Littlepage, who was unable to attend the meeting.

2. Designated Federal Officer Briefing — Melanie Farrell
(Presentation can be found at www.tva.gov/rerc and www.tva.gov/rrsc)

Melanie Farrell provided an overview of the RRSC and the RERC, TVA's two Federal Advisory Councils. The RRSC was formed in 1999 to provide advice to TVA on stewardship issues. As an example of the topics the RRSC addresses, at its September 2022 meeting, the Council reviewed TVA's River Operations Policy and also received updates from TVA's River Management and Natural Resources groups. At its most recent meeting, in October 2022, the RERC — which was created in 2013 — heard presentations on Valley Vision 2035, on TVA's New Nuclear Program and from local power company partner David Wade, President and CEO, EPB of Chattanooga (formerly Electric Power Board of Chattanooga).

Farrell said there are certain topics, such as environmental justice, which are within the purview of both Councils. TVA continually works to balance priorities across its three mission areas: reliable, low-cost energy; environmental stewardship; and economic development. With the energy system of the future evolving, there will be more topics that overlap. As the energy side of the business evolves to meet current needs, TVA must continue to be cognizant of stewardship, the environment and sustainability. Farrell provided examples of the topics the Councils have focused on over the years, and said as the evolution continues, it will be imperative for TVA to meet with the Councils for their input.

3. TVA Sustainability (Presentation can be found at www.tva.gov/rerc and www.tva.gov/rrsc) — **Rebecca Tolene, Vice President, Environment, and Chief Sustainability Officer, TVA**

Rebecca Tolene provided an overview of TVA's sustainability program and its approach to sustainability. TVA defines sustainability as "ensuring our ability to provide the people of the Tennessee Valley with low-cost and reliable electricity, a healthy environment and a prosperous economy — without compromising the ability of future generations to do the same." TVA aligns its sustainability work with the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals and the Global Reporting Initiative standards. TVA's focus areas for sustainability are:

- **Aspiring to achieve net-zero**
- **Economic Impact:** Partnering to build the region's clean energy economy
- **Environment:** Stewarding the region's resources
- **Social:** Serving people and communities across the region
- **Governance:** Driving progress through accountability and transparency.

TVA is advancing its work in the areas of biodiversity and environmental justice, and it continues to further incorporate sustainability into its business planning. It is committed to sustainability reporting and plans to publish its 4th annual Sustainability Report in May 2023.

Tolene explained that TVA is committed to engaging stakeholders, which include local power companies, directly served customers, the public, the financial community, non-government organizations, bondholders and federal, state and local governments. To that end, TVA is working to learn more about stakeholders' knowledge and awareness of TVA's sustainability efforts; identify stakeholders' sustainability priorities as well as potential areas for collaboration; and build the network of stakeholders to engage around sustainability and environmental, social and governance (ESG) issues. In 2022, TVA conducted a stakeholder engagement survey.

In their survey responses, stakeholders made it clear that reliability and affordability must be at the forefront of the transition toward clean energy. They want to be active partners in the decision-making process, and they welcome TVA's support and community engagement as they work to become more sustainable. Tolene said that innovative partnerships and meeting stakeholders' sustainability needs are key aspects of advancing sustainability in the Tennessee Valley. TVA also conducted an internal stakeholder survey. Responses indicate that TVA will benefit from building a common understanding of what sustainability means within TVA and by communicating TVA's sustainability story.

TVA's sustainability engagement next steps include finalizing the Stakeholder Engagement Results and Recommendations Report, identifying potential actions and opportunities based on external and internal results, and continuing conversations around sustainability and ESG within TVA and with external stakeholders.

QUESTIONS/ANSWERS

An RRSC member asked Tolene to describe the definition of net-zero. Tolene said TVA's aspiration is to achieve carbon reduction of net-zero by 2050, which would mean bringing emissions down in all tactical programs. There would still be some emissions, but net-zero allows an organization to offset its emissions with other activities such as tree plantings, creating other carbon sinks or, possibly, carbon capture in the future. Tolene noted that there would be some flexibility since the concept of net-zero allows the offsetting of emissions. As TVA and partners work to decarbonize, it will require additional electrification, since there is a prediction that electricity demand might double by 2050.

4. TVA Biodiversity Policy Update: Species Conservation in an Increasingly Developed World (Presentation can be found at www.tva.gov/rrsc and www.tva.gov/rrsc) — Adam Dattilo, Biodiversity Senior Program Manager, TVA

Adam Dattilo worked as an endangered species biologist at TVA for 16 years before becoming Biodiversity Senior Program Manager after the Board of Directors adopted TVA's Biodiversity Policy in November 2021. Biodiversity describes the sum total of life on earth and the ways organisms interact in ecosystems to support life. TVA has a long history of environmental work, and the Biodiversity Policy is designed to integrate biodiversity conservation into all aspects and all levels of TVA operations.

Dattilo said conservation is extremely important in the Tennessee Valley because it is a biodiverse area that contains some of the most unique and endangered habitats and species in the country. TVA's attention to biodiversity helps ensure that the agency protects the environment and makes operational decisions with conservation in mind.

TVA's Biodiversity Policy Statement says, "TVA recognizes the importance of biodiversity to the quality of life of the region's residents, and we work to proactively protect biodiversity through stewardship of public lands, management of the Tennessee River system, local and regional partnerships, and integration of species and habitat conservation in project planning." Dattilo noted that incorporating conservation into projects is a nationwide discussion, one that National Geographic highlighted in its magazine earlier in 2022.

In fiscal year 2022, TVA implemented at least 120 biodiversity projects within the categories of education and outreach, monitoring and research, and on-the-ground conservation. One example is TVA's North Alabama utility-scale solar project, which expects to construct a solar

photovoltaic (PV) facility on about 1,400 acres of the approximately 2,800-acre site. TVA is planning up to 150 acres of pollinator plantings and habitat restoration in two areas of the site, and it is partnering with state and local environmental experts so it can protect and enhance stream habitat for two imperiled species — the Tuscumbia Darter, a tiny fish that is found in about 10 places on earth, and the Round-rib Elimia, a small snail found in about five places on earth.

Dattilo said that with support from departments across TVA, the agency is assessing land it owns to identify biodiversity opportunities for planting trees and pollinator-friendly seed mixes on frequently mowed TVA properties. An example is TVA's project at Widows Creek in northeast Alabama, where TVA is planting new vegetation to transform an old coal yard into a pollinator habitat.

QUESTIONS/ANSWERS

An RERC member asked if there has been a shift in how TVA approaches biodiversity or if the activities described represent a continuation of TVA's legacy of environmental stewardship. Dattilo said it is some of both. Environmental stewardship has always been part of TVA's mission, and that continues. What is new is the incorporation of conservation into all levels of TVA operations. Another RERC member asked how TVA considers the long-term impact of renewable energy projects such as utility-scale solar projects. Dattilo said he and his teammates manage the conservation aspects of projects and consider the site and the life of the project from a habitat management perspective. Rebecca Tolene said other TVA teams look at projects from a waste-stream standpoint, considering what today's decisions could mean 20 years from now. She said TVA balances near-term and long-term demands and is working to address challenges such as the large amount of land that would be used for potential solar facilities.

Other questions/answers included:

- An RERC member asked if TVA is looking at projects through the lens of natural working land and ecosystem services and hazard or benefits they create. Are you looking at these projects in that big picture? Are you looking at hazard mitigation and carbon sequestration in these projects?
 - Dattilo said related to wildflower and pollinator habitats, TVA is using GIS-based mapping to keep track of these areas. It will share its work with the carbon team to help assess the impact of that.
 - Tolene said TVA policy experts are evaluating ways to measure things like carbon sinks and reforestation of lands along the river system. TVA has 293,000 acres of land along the river system. TVA is looking at those lands and evaluating if there are things to do from a carbon standpoint.
- An RERC member asked how the industry can become smarter about using existing places for solar facilities rather than using open spaces.
 - Tolene said the siting of solar is an important topic within TVA and with partners. TVA is developing screening tools and considers locations where it is retiring facilities. It also considers where it purchases its solar power.
 - The RERC member said TVA has an opportunity to be a leader when it comes to evaluating spaces without losing green space.
 - Tolene encouraged continued conversation and follow-up on the topic.
- An RRSC member said he appreciated the conversation and the responsibility TVA is taking. He encouraged two concepts: contingency planning for unforeseen circumstances and adaptive management.

- An RRSC member asked why TVA can't just stop mowing agency owned lands we regularly maintain.
 - Dattilo said TVA's decisions are site-specific. Some sites might be mowed because they have non-native plants that would not provide the proper habitat for targeted species. They also might be mowed in a high-traffic area where neighbors might feel like the property looks unkept. For pollinator habitats, the team evaluates the plant habitat and wildflowers that will work best. Transmission line corridors provide excellent pollinator habitat, and in some cases, TVA removes trees and leaves wildflowers on the landscape. Dattilo said the public calls if they see an area that is not mowed because they think it is not being taken care of. TVA is working to educate employees and the public to rethink the aesthetic of how landscapes are managed.
- An RRSC member asked if TVA can use its partners as education vehicles to increase public awareness.
 - Dattilo said that while TVA's Natural Resources department does educational outreach, TVA would love to talk more with partners willing to do outreach.
 - Tolene added that having partners share biodiversity and environmental messaging would help generate excitement in the community.
- An RRSC member said he is concerned with the possibility that invasive species could creep into land that is not mowed or groomed.
 - Dattilo said TVA land is monitored. As an example, he said TVA is building its new Primary System Operations Center in Meigs County, and as part of that project, TVA planted a 10-acre pollinator habitat there. He met with the facilities staff recently, and even though it won't open until next year, he is available to manage the habitat as needed. He said the new Biodiversity Policy is intended to become part of the culture of TVA, and invasive species management is part of the whole program.

4. TVA's Environmental Justice Program (Presentation can be found at www.tva.gov/erc and www.tva.gov/rrsc) — **Rebecca Tolene, Vice President, Environment, and Chief Sustainability Officer, and Janice Horn, Senior Program Manager, Environmental Justice, TVA**

Rebecca Tolene introduced TVA's environmental justice program by reviewing TVA's mission of service and its long legacy of working to make life better for people in the Tennessee Valley region. She highlighted ways that TVA addresses today's energy challenges through innovation and partnership, and she noted that TVA is working on outreach and engagement to give voice to communities with environmental justice concerns.

Janice Horn said the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency describes environmental justice as "the fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin or income, with respect to the development, implementation and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations and policies." Horn said communities that are suffering disproportionately — such as those that are impoverished — need a voice in the process. In addition to partnering with local organizations to provide programs that address disparities, TVA is working to ensure the communities have opportunities to participate in dialogue about projects or issues that could impact their communities.

Horn explained that the Justice40 Initiative was created by Executive Order 14008 under President Joe Biden in January 2021. The goal of the initiative is that at least 40 percent of the

overall benefits from certain federal investments flow to disadvantaged communities. The investments are in areas such as climate change, clean energy and energy efficiency, clean transit, affordable and sustainable housing, training and workforce development, remediation and reduction of legacy pollution, and development of critical clean water infrastructure.

TVA created its environmental justice program in fiscal year 2022, and some of its activities to date include establishing a core team that sets roadmaps and guides priorities for the program; creating a regulatory & policy team that helps communicate and track policy issues; developing a mission statement; starting an environmental justice storyboard and learning module to increase awareness and understanding across TVA; providing comments to U.S. Office of Management and Budget Memorandums regarding interim implementation guidance for the Justice40 Initiative; providing comments to the White House Environmental Justice Advisory Council's May 2021 Recommendations; and enhancing TVA's environmental justice outreach efforts.

Horn said TVA's approach to environmental justice includes embracing full participation by potentially affected communities in the decision-making process; consider avoiding, minimizing, or mitigating adverse effects on minority populations and low-income populations; and supporting receipt of benefits/grants by minority populations and low-income populations. TVA and its partners offer programs that provide home energy efficiency upgrades, increase minority participation in TVA's Quality Contractor Network, help public schools reduce energy waste and improve learning environments, and help local businesses in underserved communities make energy choices that save money and lead to decreased energy use, improved facilities and reduced carbon emissions.

Horn explained that before TVA begins any construction, demolition or expansion project, it must adhere to the NEPA (National Environmental Policy Act) process, which requires federal agencies to assess the environmental impacts of a proposed project before decisions are made. Today, TVA uses software tools to determine if a potential project is in a community that needs additional focus on environmental justice, and it is working to ensure that residents know about — and are able to provide input on — projects in their areas. TVA is using techniques such as holding public meetings in underserved communities, mailing hard-copy fact sheets to homes that may not have internet access and partnering with local organizations to learn the most-effective ways to reach community residents. In fiscal year 2023, TVA is focused on building meaningful partnerships with stakeholders, finalizing the environmental justice mission statement and key messages, enhancing internal messaging through the training module, and continuing to develop environmental justice best practices.

QUESTIONS/ANSWERS

An RERC member said teaching communities how to advocate for themselves and knowing what questions to ask is important, and that environmental education needs to start at an early age, because children will be the decisionmakers in the future. An RERC member asked how presentations are offered at public meetings — from a stage with a presenter or at stations around the room. Chris Smith, Community Relations Manager, North Region, said that for these presentations, TVA has typically used the station approach with a subject matter expert at stations around the room, because it fosters more one-on-one interaction. An RRSC member asked the definition of an environmental justice community. Horn said that based on the Justice40 Initiative, it is considered a disadvantaged community — and it can be in an urban area or rural area. The Council member said it is important to help communities without putting labels on them.

Other questions and answers included:

- An RRSC member asked how organizations do gap analyses to identify who is impacted by injustice and why. What are the measures for success in environmental justice efforts? How are they evaluated?
 - Horn said every community has its own outreach plan. If TVA provides an opportunity and someone takes that opportunity, then it is considered a success. The TVA environmental justice program is new and is continuing to build its toolbox. TVA conducts lessons learned after each event to evaluate what it could have done better.
 - Tolene said the environmental program is new and hasn't figured out that mid-stream adjustment yet, which could help the team evaluate what is working or not working so tweaks can be made as needed. Metrics also can be used to evaluate the effectiveness of each program.
 - Melanie Farrell noted that Smith is a manager in TVA's North Region, and his position is a good example of how TVA has employees on the ground in each region, so it knows what is going on in each area.
- An RRSC member asked who defines what is fair and equitable. Is it the environmental justice community that evaluates?
 - Tolene said that for some people, "meaningful involvement" might mean "you agree with me." But that can't always happen. TVA is working on evaluation tools and ways to solicit feedback from the community after an event.
- An RERC member said she appreciates that TVA is focusing on environmental justice. She encouraged TVA to share more information on environmental justice with communities, including definitions and vocabulary related to environmental justice.
- An RRSC member asked what sort of response TVA got from the Office of Management and Budget and the White House.
 - Horn said TVA did not receive a response or feedback.
- An RRSC member asked if TVA has a process or definition related to cumulative impacts.
 - Tolene said that TVA conducts cumulative impact assessments based on NEPA case law. Tolene said cumulative impacts continue to be an important topic moving forward as we work to grasp the long-term and broad environmental impacts of products and services.
- An RERC member asked if TVA maps before site selection.
 - Smith said TVA has the data and can see how many environmental justice communities are in the area and how many are located near a plant location. If considering a new site, TVA can see environmental justice communities within 10 or 20 miles of a plant location. Tolene said if TVA is looking at a greenfield, environmental justice considerations are put in play (the same as all proposed sites)
- An RERC member said he struggles with the term environmental justice because the issue is broader than the environment. He wondered if TVA has considered promoting projects as community development events rather than environmental justice events. He said people might be more engaged if a community-development approach is used.
 - Tolene said environmental justice and community development go together and can be called by many names—social justice, equity; and TVA works to develop the community as a whole. Smith said TVA is involved with workforce development and economic development in communities, and there are ways

that TVA can improve its messaging so people understand the full scope of its support.

- An RRSC member asked how TVA decided on the environmental justice definition.
 - Horn said it uses the definition described by the federal Justice40 Initiative, and for NEPA work, it uses an environmental justice screening tool.
- An RERC member reminded the group that environmental justice is a federal mandate that TVA must comply with. She said when looking at social determinants of health, the impacts are disproportionately in minority communities. She noted that the government requires organizations to follow federal guidelines that measure equity and access in order to shape development in the community.
- An RRSC member described how TVA funding in his community led to new jobs and community growth. He said economic development will help in environmental justice communities.

5. Transforming Innovative Partnerships Through Energy Assistance (Presentation can be found at www.tva.gov/lerc and www.tva.gov/rrsc) — **Frank Rapley, Senior Manager, EnergyRight® Residential Commercial Energy Solutions, TVA**

Frank Rapley explained that household incomes in the southeast fall well below the national average, which means that low-income families often have a high energy burden — meaning they spend a high amount of their income on energy. Energy assistance addresses immediate needs, but fixing the home itself is the only way to solve long-term energy affordability challenges. Fixing homes also helps lower energy demand, which reduces TVA's high peaks and helps reduce carbon emissions in the Tennessee Valley.

TVA started providing home energy makeovers in 2015, and that program led to the Energy Efficiency Information Exchange (EEIX) in 2017. From that program, the Home Uplift pilot program was created to help people reduce their utility bills and improve their quality of life through better insulation and new heating, ventilation and air conditioning (HVAC) systems. Numbers from the pilot proved the program had merit.

Today, Home Uplift is “a sustainable, equitable low-income energy efficiency and educational program deployed across the Tennessee Valley — in partnership with local power companies, healthcare partners and community-based organizations — that reduces energy burdens for residents in need.” Specialists go into the home, evaluate what it needs, and upgrade HVAC systems, water heating, duct systems, lighting, attic and wall insulation, air sealing, windows and doors, and refrigerators. Clients also receive energy efficiency education, all free of charge. The partnership program begins with charitable contributions from local power companies and a host of local organizations, and TVA matches the funds. As of September 30, 2022, Home Uplift had upgraded more than 4,000 homes at an average cost of \$10,000 per home, with 43 participating local power companies and local and TVA matching funds that total \$42.8 million. Additionally, TVA is partnering with organizations that are successful in workforce development to build the pool of qualified candidates.

TVA hired the research company, Three³ (pronounced ThreeCubed), to study non-energy benefits to Home Uplift. The study measured how the home upgrade impacted social determinants of health, including asthma, COPD, thermal stress, trade-offs to paying energy bills and quality of life. Preliminary findings from the study found that:

- Households no longer worry about having to heat or cool their homes,

- Exposure to extreme temperatures was significantly reduced after the upgrades, with a 40% reduction to summer heat and a 37% reduction to winter cold temperatures, and
- The total number of medical interventions for participants decreased more than the control group at a statistically significant level.

TVA is partnering with organizations that are deeply rooted in underserved communities to make Home Uplift more diverse and equitable across the Tennessee Valley. Looking ahead, future Home Uplift activities include working with the State of Tennessee to link study participants with TennCare claims for actual healthcare interactions and costs; researching Home Uplift social determinants of health in Tennessee's distressed rural counties; guiding local power companies and community-based organizations to further Home Uplift's reach; and creating a partner portal and online application as well as a referral network that ensures families receive the services they need.

QUESTIONS/ANSWERS

An RERC member noted that Home Uplift is a win-win that advances local energy goals while meeting economic development needs in the community. An RRSC member from North Alabama encouraged TVA to expand Home Uplift and other programs in all of the states in its service area. Rapley said TVA is eager to offer programs wherever they are needed. An RRSC member asked if all local power companies are participating. Rapley said the program is open to all local power companies, and 43 are currently up and operating in the program. There will be new entrants in fiscal year 2023. TVA works with the local power companies to help them find funding. An RRSC member asked if renters can participate. Rapley said the program can assist up to 50% rentals. Renters can apply if they get an agreement from the landlord, and the program works with buildings that have up to four units. An RRSC member said local power companies have to be good stewards of ratepayers' money and there is more need than what local power companies can provide. There is a large amount of money from the states, and in Kentucky, there is some confusion about how the program will be implemented and a need for contractors who are willing to get certified to do this. The Council member said it is a big opportunity and asked TVA get in there with the states to see what it can get done. Rapley said TVA is reaching out to all of the state energy offices or wherever the weatherization assistance program is run. The issue is that a lot of the fine print is not written yet. TVA joined the National Association of State Energy Offices, which will advise the Department of Energy (DOE) on the rule writing, so TVA will have a voice at the table. TVA is engaging at the national and state levels so it keeps abreast of how to access funding that will help local families.

5. Advice Questions and Discussion

Advice Questions

1. TVA has invested additional resources and attention toward improving identification and partnership with environmental justice communities. Do you believe this investment of time and resources is worthwhile, and should TVA continue to invest in these areas? If yes, why do you see this investment as valuable?
2. Our environmental justice program aims to promote respectful forms of collaboration and to provide a voice to environmental justice communities. Do you have any feedback or additional tools you believe TVA should consider in its environmental justice program? What techniques have been effective in communicating with and building relationships with environmental justice communities in your region?

3. When interacting and listening to environmental justice communities, TVA receives comments regarding social issues and concerns unrelated to a TVA project or outside of our statutory purpose. Are there specific organizations in your communities that you believe TVA should work with so these interactions are captured and shared?

RERC and RRSC members were asked to weigh in on the topics before each Council's draft Advice Statement was prepared.

RERC members' comments and suggestions included:

Question #1

- People struggle with vocabulary around environmental justice.
- Environmental justice is a worthwhile investment of time, and TVA should continue to do it. It is a valuable investment because there is no downside to public engagement, outreach and community development.
- The public power model and the fundamental tenants of public power — public participation, affordability, reliability, community benefits — require collaboration between TVA and communities impacted by pollution. There are big opportunities there to resolve the inequities and injustices that have occurred over decades. I am encouraged by TVA's focus on this topic.
- It is important for TVA to establish what the boundaries are for environmental justice. I could see how it could get out of hand quickly and get a long way from the TVA mandate.
- We are moving into an era of massive buildouts and massive buildup of generation. This is potentially a capital-intensive era, and that will require buy-in from people at every economic level. If want to achieve net-zero, it will require sharing of the burden.
- In thinking through some of these large infrastructure investments that transform communities, they are not being done in a vacuum. Being able to engage with environmental justice communities seems critical to doing this in the best possible way. We have talked about different terms —disadvantaged, environmental justice, under-invested — but we really are thinking about how to invest in these communities to bring about change.
- Environmental justice is critical and worth the investment. First, diversity of thought leads to better outcomes, and having perspectives at the table that generally haven't been there before will lead to better outcomes. The second thing is that there is a lot of short-term work that goes into the stakeholder engagement process, but there is long-term reward because having that buy-in early on means you have their opinion from the get-go and you have a better long-term relationship with the community.
- It is a worthwhile investment. It is important as we go along to document how these efforts are influencing TVA's thinking. If you are able to talk about that, it might encourage more participation and might help identify which efforts are working and which aren't.
- When it comes to workforce development and other programs, it is good to assess where TVA fits in. There are so many people doing so many things that you sometimes get redundancy and duplication. We need to be mindful of that. We want it to be meaningful change. Doing a real assessment of who's doing what is critical.
- In representing customers at large, we need to find every source of funding that is available to TVA to do these types of programs and not throw the burden on ratepayers' backs.

Question #2

- Being authentic and trusted partners and going out and speaking and also seeking people's perspectives are important for building relationships with environmental justice communities. Think about having focus groups and also have trusted messengers so there is two-way communication with information that is understandable and meaningful.
- It is not an either-or situation; we have to invest in all of it. If you don't have these conversations, there could be adverse impacts. These discussions and projects can benefit these communities. It is the right thing to do to build a more equitable, inclusive and fair community, and the work can improve standards of living for people across the Valley.
- It is well worth our time and effort. Citizens want to know what you are going to do for them, and they want to know when it is going to happen. That is the part that is missing. We need to be able to share a timeline, and your communication needs to be relevant to the community.
- It is important to listen, but it is also important to communicate that you are listening and to effectively show the community the changes you have made.
- The TVA regional community outreach folks have been helpful. I have gotten to know the woman in our community, and TVA is there on the ground. We do community outreach. These communities are used to people talking AT them regarding what is being done in their community. If you can find community leaders who can help to gain trust in the community, that would be very helpful. You have to know who the leaders are in the community who can help spread the word.
- This is long-term work, and it takes time. You can't eliminate inequity with one solution. Staff training is important, embedding it in the organization is important. This is less transactional and more transformational. Environmental justice is in TVA's bones. It started with FDR, and that is what TVA has done for over 80 years. Listen to communities; that is critical to this work.

Question #3

- Can you explain what you mean by social issues outside TVA projects?
 - Tolene explained that if TVA is seeking public input on a project such as a transmission line, people in a disadvantaged community may be facing more pressing issues such as the inability to feed their family. Talking about the transmission line is not high on their priority list. She said TVA needs to think about how to connect to the right entities to connect with all communities. Nothing prevents you from creating a broader session and bringing in other organizations for community development. Outreach is part of your program, and there are a lot of other organizations that could provide support.
 - Every community is different. If someone calls with a question that isn't in our purview, doing a Google search for them can go a long way — rather than just saying that isn't what we do. The search might not yield exactly what they are looking for, but it might get them closer. People can be appreciative that you took the time to help them, because it shows you are making a genuine effort to answer their questions.

RRSC members' comments and suggestions included:

Question #1

- It is a worthwhile mission. One of the first things we talked about today is that TVA needed to be net-zero. If people have better-sealed houses and are more energy efficient, it will help the Valley get to net-zero by 2050. It is a good investment in the communities.
- One of my mottos is, “If not me, who? If not now, when?” Now is the time. A lot of people are talking about it, and I am glad TVA is taking a proactive approach.
- Doesn’t it have to be “yes” because of the Justice40 Initiative? With so much money going through the pipeline, TVA needs to work efficiently and quickly to take full advantage of the opportunity.
- TVA has to do it. The question is HOW do we do it. TVA has to figure out how to do it and how to do it the most efficient way.
- Economic development is one of the original purposes of TVA, and this certainly relates to economic development and aligns with one of your mandates.
- Are we answering the right questions? I keep leaning toward physical investments in these communities, but the questions keep saying investment in additional resources to improve identification and partnership with environmental justice communities. Are we talking about communicating with environmental communities or spending money in these environmental communities?
 - Tolene said as the industry and TVA move toward a new clean energy infrastructure, the work will impact communities, including environmental justice communities. TVA has had a harder time having meaningful engagement with environmental communities. The advice questions being asked today are talking about how TVA engages with them so they are part of the conversation.

Question #2

- Does TVA go to County Commissioner boards in small towns? In rural communities, I am not sure a lot of people have the means to show up at a community event. They might not have the time; they might be working a lot. County Commissioners know the community very well and know how to serve their community’s best interest.
- Being part of a community is part of TVA’s culture. You don’t need to reinvent the wheel; you can leverage employees and work with local power companies. We don’t need more programs; there are other ways to get involved without creating another program.
- Communities have immediate needs, and if they aren’t met, you won’t get great information on what is coming down the road. To get past that, you may need to find a way to meet some needs to get to the next level for the long-term planning and long-term goal.

Question #3

- TVA might be able to rely on local or state government for contacts as well as its External Affairs department.
- TVA needs to put special thought into collaboration. There does not need to be discernment about whether to do it. Related to environmental justice, it is what it is, so let’s address it and fix it.

After the Councils’ comments, the RERC and RRSC met in breakout groups to discuss drafts that had been written, along with TVA staff, by Erin Gill (for RERC) and Danette Scudder (for RRSC). The Councils made tweaks to the drafts, then each voted unanimously on their subsequent advice statements. The Councils got back together as a large group, and Erin Gill read the RERC Advice Statement and Danette Scudder read the RRSC Advice Statement.

6. Closing Comments

Melanie Farrell thanked the Councils for their Advice Statements. She said TVA will take their input and incorporate it into its thinking, planning and focused efforts on environmental justice. She said she will take the advice and share it in the next quarter with the Board committee. She said TVA will celebrate its 90th birthday next year, and there is a lot to celebrate. She said TVA is not just looking at short-term objectives but is continually focused on its mission — which is relevant today, just like in 1933. She said the RRSC will next meet in March 2023, and the RERC will meet in April 2023. She encouraged the Council members to send suggestions for meeting topics.

**Regional Energy Resource Council
Advice Statement
November 3, 2022**

TVA's Environmental Justice focus on ensuring meaningful involvement is essential to advancing TVA's mission and its continued success as a public power company. Through these efforts, TVA should continue to invest time and resources to proactively build deep, authentic relationships with Environmental Justice (EJ) communities in order to 1) establish two-way pathways for accurate, complete, and representative information to be shared between TVA and EJ Communities; 2) Efficiently and effectively comply with Federal National Environmental Policy Act and EJ screening requirements (i.e. Justice40, as applicable); and 3) Understand the economic/community development needs of EJ communities so as to identify win-win opportunities within TVA's core mission and mandated authority.

While challenging, meaningful Environmental Justice involvement is an imperative and an opportunity. This work must be done well and in a timely manner to ensure that TVA can successfully deploy new facilities and programs that are critical to meeting the energy needs of the Valley. Effective EJ engagement can also leverage significant opportunity to advance TVA and Valley community goals through Federal investment and new partnerships.

This work should not be seen as simply a program but rather a core part of TVA's culture. Building deep, authentic relationships with EJ communities is a long-term investment that should be approached through the lens of transformation, rather than simply transactions. Effective partnership with EJ communities will be predicated on trust, and efforts must be deliberate to ensure they seek and include representative and diverse perspectives. Resources to accomplish this should be focused both internally and externally. Specific ideas include:

Internally:

- Refining appropriate terminology and establishing a shared vocabulary
- Training across business units to share EJ concepts and best practices – including specific training opportunities for front-line employee ambassadors
- Reinforcing a culture of customer service and problem solving
- Leveraging and resourcing TVA's new Regional model through Regional Relations Community teams

Externally:

- Proactive outreach and investment with consistent touch points that address short term opportunities as a foundation for longer term work.
- Consistent, open, and responsive sharing of information, facts, timeline, and progress before, during, and after specific projects.
- Transparency around where input has been utilized (or not) so that input is seen as meaningful
- Intentional multi-generational, culturally inclusive education to increase environmental/energy literacy and understanding of TVA history, mission and future.
- Routine engagement with elected officials, trusted community leaders, and other representative ambassadors.
- Understand and communicate required compliance with applicable local, state, tribal and Federal regulations.

**Regional Resource Stewardship Council
Advice Statement
November 3, 2022**

The Regional Resource Stewardship Council commends TVA on their proactive approach to address Environmental Justice. This initiative is important for the Tennessee Valley to represent Environmental Justice interests to not only meet applicable federal requirements but also align with TVA's mission. Mechanisms such as public engagement and outreach are consistent with fundamental tenets of the public power model and the dynamics and relationships that make the Tennessee Valley unique. Investing time and resources in Environmental Justice initiatives can contribute to creating an enduring organizational culture that will inform TVA's operations, directly impacting the ability to meet net zero goals. It is imperative to develop solutions with an eye towards efficiency and effectiveness to maximize resources and minimize impacts to rate payers.

Tools TVA might consider for Environmental Justice outreach include:

- building relationships and establishing trust with community leaders and local elected officials, who have an understanding of the priorities, interests and limitations of constituents and communities they represent,
- leveraging existing community relationships of employees, customers, and other strategic partners to reach communities,
- identifying existing programs within communities to coordinate and maximize use of resources,
- utilizing available resources to meet short-term needs in order to gain support and create a pathway to address longer-term ideas and initiatives,
- share success stories and previous projects, including measures that demonstrate positive outcomes, with communities that they can relate to for greater trust and better understanding of proposed ideas and projects,
- leverage TVA's relationships in communities to facilitate connections for community collaboration.

In this process, TVA will be made aware of social issues and concerns that are outside the scope of their work or statutory purpose. In these cases, it could be helpful to communities for TVA to develop partnerships with local and state governments and other community organizations that can facilitate meeting community needs.

**Appendix A
Non-Council Meeting Attendees**

TVA Staff Members	
Rebecca Brinkley	Jo Anne Lavender
Aaron Brown	Kendra Mansur
Jennifer Brundige	Skip Markham
Cathy Coffey	Ashley Moore
Adam Dattilo (presenter)	Barbie Perdue
Ashley Farless	Frank Rapley (presenter)
Melanie Farrell	Marylee Sauder
Bekim Haliti	Chris Smith
Rebecca Hayden	Russell Smith
Janice Horn (presenter)	Logan Stephens
Althea Jones	Rachel Terrell
Mike Kitzman	Rebecca Tolene (presenter)
Leslie Golden	McKenzie Whitten
Tiffany Foster	Thomas Barnett
Holly Hoyle	Elizabeth Upchurch
Tammie Belcher	Rick Underwood
Jennifer Bogus	Heather Kulisek

Stakeholders	
Jenn Tribble	Maggie Shober
Ashli Blow	Amy Kelly
Rachel Maitland	Al Berrong
Harriet Richardson	

**Regional Resource Stewardship Council and Regional Resource Stewardship Council
Combined Meeting Agenda
November 3rd, 2022
Sonesta Hotel, Nashville, Tennessee**

Objectives:

- Seek RRSC and RERC advice on TVA's Environmental Justice Program
- Update and inform members of TVA's Sustainability Program

Advice Questions:

- TVA has invested additional resources and attention toward improving identification and partnership with Environmental Justice communities. Do you believe this investment of time and resources is worthwhile, and should TVA continue to invest in these areas? If yes, why do you see this investment as valuable?
- Our environmental justice program aims to promote respectful forms of collaboration and to provide a voice to environmental justice communities. Do you have any feedback or additional tools you believe TVA should consider in its environmental justice program? What techniques have been effective in communicating with and building relationships with Environmental Justice communities in your region?
- When interacting and listening to EJ communities, TVA receives comments regarding social issues and concerns unrelated to a TVA project or outside of our statutory purpose. Are there specific organizations in your communities that you believe TVA should work with so these interactions are captured and shared?

November 3rd

8:30-8:45	Welcome/Call Meeting to Order
8:45-9:15	Introductions and Agenda Review
9:15-9:30	DFO Briefing
9:30-9:45	Break
9:45-11:45	TVA's Sustainability Work, Biodiversity Policy, and Environmental Justice Program
11:45-12:45	Advice Question Discussion
1:45-2:45	Chair Development of Draft Advice Statements
2:45-4:15	Finalize Advice Statements with Councils in Separate Rooms
4:15-4:30	Read Final Advice Statements to Combined Group
4:30-5:00	Closing Remarks
5:00	Adjourn Meeting