

TDOT State Route 28 (US127) [800.11(e) Documentation]
As of September 12, 2014
Cumberland County, Tennessee

Description of the Undertaking

The Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA) received a 26a permit request in March 2010 from the Tennessee Department of Transportation (TDOT) for proposed improvements to State Route 28 (US 127) from State Route 68 to Cleveland Street in Crossville, Tennessee (Project). The Project area is located in Cumberland County, Tennessee. The proposed improvements include channel and stream relocations, wetland impacts, new and existing culvert extensions, utility crossings and redesign of the triangle intersection of State Route 68 and State Route 28 (Appendix A). Three of the crossings and the triangle intersection are within the boundary of the Cumberland Homesteads Historic District (CHHD) which is listed in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP).

Description of the Steps Taken to Identify Historic Properties

TDOT began their review of impacts on historic properties in 1994 by conducting a field review of the Project area. In 1996, TDOT prepared a report to document the findings from the 1994 field review which concluded that the CHHD would be adversely affected by the Project. A Phase I archaeological survey was conducted by Alexander Archaeological Consultants in 1997 (Appendix C).

A reconnaissance survey was completed in 2004 by Parsons Brinkerhoff for TDOT that reevaluated the National Register-listed properties included in the District. TDOT prepared the documentation of effect report in 2005 (Appendix C).

TVA assumed lead agency status for the Project in 2010, after receiving the permit request. The agency has reviewed the documentation provided by TDOT and has determined, in consultation with the TNSHPO, that the CHHD would be adversely affected by the Project (Appendix B).

In 2013, TVA requested editorial changes to Figure 11 (page 43) in the Documentation of Effect Report and Figures 6 and 7 (pages 13 and 14) in Appendix E of the Documentation of Effect Report, and TDOT provided revised figures that accurately depict the area within the historic district that does not retain its historic integrity (Appendix E in the draft MOA)

TVA investigated the question whether the historic Eldridge House was demolished in or after 2005 to avoid the requirements of Section 106. TVA determined, after consultation with the ACHP that Section 110(k) of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) does not apply to the Eldridge House because this property was demolished by a private party; TDOT did not have the legal power to prevent the demolition; and it occurred several years before TDOT applied for the permit from TVA (Appendix F in the draft MOA)

TVA also investigated the question whether the historic government garage or other historic/potentially historic properties were demolished in or after 2005 to avoid the requirements of Section 106. TVA determined, after consultation with the ACHP, that Section 110(k) of the NHPA does not apply to the government garage because the National Park Service found that it did not retain sufficient integrity to be eligible for the NRHP due to alterations and additions (Appendix G in the draft MOA).

Description of Cumberland Homesteads Historic District

The Cumberland Homesteads Community was founded in 1934 as a part of F.D. Roosevelt's New Deal. The community is known for its architectural style of the houses, outbuildings, and public buildings. The Cumberland Homesteads Community is the largest of the communities built by the Division of Subsistence Homesteads in the nation. The community encompasses approximately 10,250 acres and the 1,300-acre Cumberland Mountain State Park is located in the center of the community. The Civil Works Administration began clearing the land in 1934. Architect William Macy Stanton designed the site plans and the buildings (Straw 225-226). The area originally consisted of 251 Farm Homesteads built on lots averaging from 10 to 160 acres with the average homestead consisting of 16 acres (National Register of Historic Places #88001593). The farmsteads included a residence and multiple outbuildings. The homes feature native Crab Orchard sandstone construction. A number of community buildings were also constructed which included a water tower, the Cumberland Homesteads Tower, the Homestead elementary and high schools, two factories, a store, a government garage, and a loom house.

The District was listed on the NRHP in 1988 under National Register Criteria A and C for its significance in Social History, Community Planning and Development, Agriculture and Architecture. The Cumberland Homesteads project had a major economic impact at the local level, but is also of national significance as an intact planned community representative of an important New Deal movement to aid destitute rural families (National Register of Historic Places #88001593).

Determination of Adverse Effect

Adverse effect determinations are summarized in 36CFR part 800.5(a)(1-2):

An adverse effect is found when an undertaking may alter, directly or indirectly, any of the characteristics of a historic property that qualify the property for inclusion in the National Register in a manner that would diminish the integrity of the property's location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling or association. Consideration shall be given to all qualifying characteristics of a historic property, including those that may have been identified subsequent to the original evaluation for the National Register. Adverse effects may include reasonably foreseeable effects cause by the undertaking that may occur later in time, be farther removed in distance or be cumulative.

(2) Examples of adverse effects.

Adverse effects on historic properties include, but are not limited to:

- (i) Physical destruction of or damage to all or part of the property;*
- (ii) Alteration of the property, including restoration, rehabilitation, repair, maintenance, stabilization, hazardous material remediation, and provision of handicapped access, that is not consistent with the Secretary's Standards for the treatment of historic properties (36CFR part 68) and applicable guidelines;*
- (iii) Removal of the property from its historic location;*
- (iv) Change in character of the property's use or of physical features within the property's setting that contribute to its historic significance;*
- (v) Introduction of visual, atmospheric or audible elements that diminish the integrity of the property's significant historic features*
- (vi) Neglect of a property which causes its deterioration, except where such neglect and deterioration are recognized qualities of a property of religious and cultural significance to an Indian tribe or Native Hawaiian organization; and*

(vii) Transfer, lease, or sale of property out of Federal ownership or control without restrictions or conditions to ensure long-term preservation of the property's historic significance.

An adverse effect occurs when a characteristic of a historic property that qualifies it for eligibility is diminished.

The CHHD was listed on the NRHP in 1988 under National Register Criteria A and C for its significance in Social History, Community Planning and Development, Agriculture and Architecture (National Register Nomination #88001593). The proposed improvements to State Route 28 will result in an adverse effect to the District by physical destruction (i) and removal from its historic location (iii). The Project will require right-of-way to be taken from within the historic district and the physical destruction of the triangle intersection will adversely affect the CHHD. The proposed improvements will not result in an adverse effect under Criteria ii, iv, v, vi, and vii.

Please refer to the stipulations detailed in the draft MOA for a list of the potential measures to reduce and mitigate adverse effects to the District.

Documentation of Consulting Party Viewpoints

TVA has consulted with the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, the State Historic Preservation Office, the Tennessee Department of Transportation, the Army Corps of Engineers, the City of Crossville, the Cumberland Homesteads Tower Association, the National Trust for Historic Preservation, the Sierra Club, Statewide Organizing for Community eMpowerment, Dr. Calvin Dickinson, and Dr. Michael Birdwell (Appendix B of the draft MOA).

References Cited

Alexander, Lawrence

2000 Phase I Archaeological Survey of Proposed State Route 28 (US-127) From 0.16+ km South of Saw Mill Road to Cleveland Street in Crossville, and the Proposed State Route 392 Extension, From State Route 28 South of Crossville to State Route 1 (US-70) East of Crossville, Cumberland County, Tennessee. Report submitted to the Tennessee Valley Authority, Cultural Resources, Knoxville, Tennessee.

Brookhart, G. Donald

1998 Cumberland County. *The Tennessee Encyclopedia of History and Culture*, edited by Carroll Van West, pp. 414-415. The Rutledge Hill Press, Nashville

Sellers, Tammy Allison

2005 *Historical /Architectural Assessment and Documentation of Effect Report Pursuant to 36 CFR 800 For Proposed Improvements to State Route 28 (U.S. 127) From State Route 68 to Cleveland Street in Crossville, Cumberland County.* Report prepared by Tennessee Department of Transportation.

Straw, Elizabeth A.

1998 Cumberland Homesteads. *The Tennessee Encyclopedia of History and Culture*, edited by Carroll Van West, pp.225-226. The Rutledge Hill Press, Nashville.

National Register of Historic Places, Cumberland Homesteads Historic District, Crossville,
Cumberland County, Tennessee, National Register #88001593.